



Legal Analysis of Tengkawang Seed Exports in the Context of Natural Resource Conservation

Devi Mutiara Sanni¹, Achmad Hariri^{2*}

^{1,2}Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surabaya, Indonesia

*Corresponding email: achmadhariri@um-surabaya.ac.id

Info Artikel

Submitted: 10/11/2024

Revised: 27/11/2024

Accepted: 19/12/2024

Keywords:

Legal Analysis; Export of Tengkawang Seeds; Natural Resource Conservation

DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.37253/jjr.v26i2.9936>

Abstract

The conflict between the Regulation of the Minister of Environment and Forestry (LHK) No. P.106/MENLHK/SETJEN/KUM.1/12/2018 and the Regulation of the Minister of Trade (Permendag) No. 44 of 2012 has created significant legal uncertainty regarding the protection and trade of tengkawang seeds in Indonesia. The LHK Regulation does not include tengkawang seeds as a protected plant species, while the Permendag prohibits the export of tengkawang seeds. This study aims to analyze the normative conflict related to the regulations governing the export of tengkawang seeds and its implications for environmental conservation and the economy in Pontianak City. The research methodology used is normative analysis with a statutory approach. Legal materials were obtained through document studies of laws and regulations and literature reviews. The research results show that this regulatory conflict hinders the export of tengkawang seeds, harms business actors, and potentially increases illegal trade activities. Furthermore, this inconsistency also causes confusion among law enforcement officials and the general public regarding the protection status of tengkawang seeds. This study recommends harmonizing regulations between the Ministry of Environment and Forestry and the Ministry of Trade to ensure effective protection of tengkawang seeds while supporting economic growth through legal and regulated trade. Additionally, in accordance with the legal principle *lex posterior derogat legi priori*, the newer law should prevail. Moreover, as per the LHK regulation, tengkawang seeds are not classified as protected plant varieties, which legally allows them to be exported.



Copyright© 2024 by Author(s)

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial-Share Alike 4.0 International License.

A. INTRODUCTION

Tengkawang seeds, known by their scientific name *Shorea Robusta*, are categorized as Non-Timber Forest Products (NTFPs) from the Dipterocarpaceae family (Darmawan et al., 2022). Tengkawang seeds hold significant economic value for Indonesia, particularly in Kalimantan regions such as Pontianak City, due to their beneficial properties. Tengkawang trees have a unique reproductive cycle, producing large quantities of fruit only every few years (Randa et al., 2022). This fact suggests that harvesting tengkawang seeds does not directly threaten the sustainability of the trees. As an export commodity, tengkawang seeds have become a primary source of livelihood for communities living near forest areas

(Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan, 2023). In fact, communities in the Kalimantan forest regions, especially in West Kalimantan, have designated tengkawang seeds as the official mascot of the province. (B. Winarni et al., 2017)

Thus regulations regarding the export of tengkawang seeds are necessary to manage the international sale of tengkawang seeds without damaging their habitat. Regulations in the export sector play a crucial role in ensuring that international trade is conducted sustainably, safely, and in compliance with standards in both the country of origin and the destination country (APINDO, 2024). Additionally, such regulations aim to prevent deforestation of forest resources used as export commodities. These efforts support the continued functioning of forests as carbon sinks, protectors of soil from erosion, and habitats for wildlife (Yuniansari, 2023). This becomes increasingly important in the context of today's globalized world. Research conducted by Dewi Sartika Bahrani in her study titled "Export Trends of Indonesia's Non-Timber Forest Product Tengkawang to Japan from 2005 to 2018" highlights that tengkawang fruit has a significant impact on the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) between Japan and Indonesia. (Bahrani, 2020).

This finding aligns with research conducted by Satria Astana et al., which states that exporting tengkawang seeds has a more positive impact on tengkawang farmers' economy compared to selling through intermediaries at relatively low prices (Astana et al., 1987). Research by Winarni et al. further notes that Indonesia once exported 10,677.01 tons of tengkawang seeds, generating foreign exchange revenue of US\$7,439,167.75 This amount does not include the sale of tengkawang seedcake (I. Winarni et al., 2004). It is evident that every part of the tengkawang tree holds high economic value, and this significantly impacts the income of tengkawang farmers (Kusumaningtyas et al., 2012). However, the current issue is that the Minister of Trade's regulation prohibits the export of tengkawang seeds, which has disappointed tengkawang farmers. The regulation of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry does not classify tengkawang as a protected species, further complicating matters. Despite this, previous studies have not addressed the conflict between the Ministry of Environment and Forestry's regulation and the Ministry of Trade's regulation prohibiting exports. This regulatory conflict is an important issue to investigate, as regulations are a key component in ensuring the legality of tengkawang exports.

In the context of inter-ministerial regulations governing the export of tengkawang seeds, there is a normative conflict between the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (KLHK) and the Ministry of Trade (Kemendag) concerning the utilization of natural resources that are economically valuable and environmentally sustainable. This divergence creates inconsistency, affecting the legal utilization of tengkawang seeds, especially in export activities. The Ministry of Environment and Forestry (KLHK), through its Ministerial Regulation No.

P.106/MENLHK/SETJEN/KUM.1/12/2018, establishes a list of protected plant and animal species in Indonesia. Tengkawang seeds are not included in this list, meaning that tengkawang seeds can be harvested and traded, including for export, without special protection measures. On the other hand, the Ministry of Trade (Kemendag) prohibits the export of tengkawang seeds under Ministerial Regulation No. 44 of 2012. Consequently, the price of tengkawang seeds reportedly dropped after the issuance of Permendag No. 44/M-DAG/PER/7/2012 regarding goods prohibited for export (Heri et al., 2020).

The differing interpretations between these two ministerial regulations have caused regulatory overlap, leading to confusion and barriers for tengkawang seed exporters (Siti, 2023). Although tengkawang seeds are not classified as protected species under the KLHK regulation, the export licensing process is often hindered by strict policies from the Ministry of Trade. The export prohibition regulations frequently have negative consequences, including harm to small farmers and underutilization of the economic potential of the commodity (Wahyuni, 2022).

The potential impact of this regulatory conflict on the trade sector is significant. Regulatory uncertainty creates obstacles in the export process, resulting in a decline in tengkawang seed trade volumes (Badan Standardisasi Nasional, 2021). If this regulatory misalignment continues, exporters may face difficulties in meeting international demand, causing the potential revenue from these exports to remain underutilized and reducing local income. Additionally, it could affect the welfare of communities dependent on this industry. Therefore, based on the introduction and the issues presented above, the following research questions are proposed: How are the regulations governing tengkawang seed exports related to conservation, And what are the legal implications of tengkawang seed export practices on the sustainability of natural resources.

B. RESEARCH METHOD

The research method used in this study is a normative analysis method with a statutory approach, focusing on Legal Analysis of Tengkawang Seed Exports in the Context of Natural Resource Conservation and its implications for environmental conservation and the economy in Pontianak City. Normative research allows for the examination of legal theories and principles to evaluate laws and regulations affecting business actors, law enforcement officials, and the general public (Dr. Nurul Qamar, S.H. & Farah Syah Rezah, S.H., 2020). The approach utilized in this research is a statutory approach. Legislative texts serve as the primary source for understanding the substance and provisions concerning the Legal Analysis of Tengkawang Seed Exports in the Context of Natural Resource Conservation. Secondary sources, such as legal journals and related literature, are used to support the analysis.

The legal material collection technique in this study employs literature review or desk research, conducted through the collection and analysis of legal documents and legal theories relevant to the research focus. These documents include legislative texts, relevant expert opinions, and related ministerial regulations. Legal material analysis is carried out by identifying and analyzing various regulations governing the export of tengkawang seeds in the context of natural resource conservation and evaluating the legal implications of tengkawang seed export practices on the sustainability of natural resources.

C. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Regulations Governing Tengkawang Seed Exports in the Context of Conservation

Tengkawang seeds, known as non-timber forest products (NTFPs), are native to the Kalimantan forest region (Leksono & Hakim, 2018). Tengkawang, an endemic species, grows only in Kalimantan. According to Melda Nuryanti's study, *Community Perception of the Potential of Tengkawang Fruit as a Rare Economic Fruit from West Kalimantan*, the main Tengkawang-producing areas are West Kalimantan's regions like Sanggau, Kapuas Hulu, Sintang, Pontianak, Sambas, and Ketapang (Nuryanti & Suwarno, 2021). This aligns with the characteristics of Tengkawang, which thrives under conditions typical of Kalimantan's tropical rainforests. The potential uses of Tengkawang for the local community include harvesting its fruit, wood, and resin. Processing Tengkawang seeds into pure tengkawang butter represents a primary industry with significant potential in forest-derived products (Saridan et al., 2013).

Tengkawang seeds can be processed into oil rich in vegetable fats, sharing similar characteristics with cocoa butter, including its melting point (Diba et al., 2023). Traditionally, Tengkawang oil has been used in culinary applications, as a flavor enhancer, and as an ingredient in medicinal preparations. Industrially, Tengkawang oil is used as a substitute for cocoa butter, a component in the pharmaceutical and cosmetics industries, and in the production of candles, soaps, margarine, and lubricants (B. Winarni et al., 2017).

In a study by Riska and Togar Fernando Manurung, *Vegetative Morphology of Tengkawang Trees (Shorea spp) in Mensiau Village, Batang Lupar District, Kapuas Hulu Regency*, it is noted that the community has utilized Tengkawang seeds for hundreds of years, and it has become an emblem for West Kalimantan (Riska & Manurung, 2019). Tengkawang grows naturally, widely spread across remote areas, along riverbanks, lowlands, and mountainous regions (Tampubolon et al., 2018). Given these attributes, Tengkawang seeds should ideally become a commodity that supports local economies and provides extensive economic benefits to the local communities. However, regulations are required to ensure that its use does not threaten Tengkawang's vegetation. As a forest product,

Tengkawang seeds' utilization, especially within the trade sector, must comply with conservation rules and applicable regulations

In the context of Tengkawang seeds, these regulations serve to balance economic benefits with environmental preservation. Without regulations, excessive exploitation could damage the tropical rainforest ecosystem. Regulations overseeing the collection and trade of Tengkawang seeds ensure these trees remain sustainable and are not irresponsibly cut down (Menteri LHK, 2020). Moreover, export regulations help ensure that exported products meet quality standards required by destination countries such as the United States, Japan, and Europe (Nurhikmah, 2023). Quality standards are crucial to maintaining the product's reputation in global markets, especially in the cosmetics, pharmaceutical, and food industries (Kementerian Perdagangan Republik Indonesia, 2021). Export regulations also promote sustainable forest management practices.

Effective export regulations additionally protect the rights of local communities that rely on Tengkawang for their livelihoods (Azzahra, 2023). Furthermore, clear and stringent rules help reduce illegal trade, which could harm both the market and have negative effects on the economy and environment (Putri & Yuliani, 2023). For Tengkawang seeds, these regulations help prevent illegal sales that could deprive the country of revenue and harm the product's reputation.

Alongside compliance with domestic regulations, proper export regulations also ensure adherence to international standards (Ramadhan & Mandasari, 2024), facilitating access to global markets and encouraging transparency and accountability in the export process. Thus, products like Tengkawang oil, known as "Illipe butter," can meet strict environmental standards in destination countries. Ultimately, sound regulations support local economic growth in areas such as Pontianak, Kalimantan, where the economic potential of Tengkawang seeds can be optimally harnessed without damaging the environment. With effective regulations, Indonesia can ensure that valuable commodities like Tengkawang seeds provide long-term benefits for local communities, the national economy, and environmental sustainability.

In his journal article, *Juridical and Sociological Study of the Harvesting of State Forest Products*, Arif Rahman explains that forest resource utilization is an activity directly related to deriving benefits from forest products as assets that can be used or extracted by individuals or groups within communities near the forest (Rahman & Mulada, 2020). Article 17, paragraph (1) of Government Regulation No. 6 of 2007 concerning Forest Management and Preparation of Forest Management Plans and Forest Utilization, stipulates that the purpose of forest utilization is to obtain forest products and services optimally and fairly for the welfare of society while preserving forest sustainability.

Environmental law expert Suparto Wjiyo of Airlangga University emphasizes the need for comprehensive evaluation, especially in regulatory

aspects, in forest management and utilization of forest resources (Wicaksana, 2022). Several regulations concerning the proper utilization of forest resources could inform policy recommendations regarding the use of Tengkawang seeds as an export commodity. For example, Article 33, paragraph 2 of Law No. 41 of 1999 on Forestry states that the harvesting and processing of forest products must not exceed the sustainable carrying capacity of the forest. This carrying capacity refers to the forest ecosystem's ability to produce resources without disrupting its ecological balance. Ecologically, Tengkawang trees play an important role in tropical rainforest ecosystems, including carbon sequestration, soil erosion protection, and providing habitat for various wildlife species (Farida Herry Susanty & Deddy Dwi Nur Cahyono, 2020).

Based on the Context of Law No. 41 of 1999, the Utilization of Forest Products such as Tengkawang for Export Must Consider the Forest's Carrying Capacity, Aiming to Improve Welfare, Ensure Forest Sustainability (Jumanto & Martono, 2020) and Maintain the Growth and Development of Tengkawang Trees. This Encourages Environmentally Friendly Forest Management Practices, Which Ultimately Supports the Conservation of Indonesia's Tropical Rainforests.

Article 21 of Law No. 5 of 1990 on the Conservation of Natural Resources and Their Ecosystems stipulates that every person is prohibited from taking, cutting, owning, damaging, destroying, keeping, transporting, and trading protected plants or their parts, whether alive or dead. Therefore, plant species that are subject to conservation efforts cannot be utilized or damaged.

According to the Regulation of the Minister of Environment and Forestry (LHK) No. P.106/MENLHK/SETJEN/KUM.1/12/2018, Tengkawang seeds are not included in the list of plant species under conservation efforts. This ministerial regulation governs the protection of plant and animal species, including some economically valuable plant species. The regulation accommodates changes in the population and distribution of plants and takes into consideration forest utilization plans and land clearing (Alfiana, 2020).

Article 5 of Government Regulation No. 7 of 1999 on the Preservation of Plant and Animal Species sets forth the conditions under which plant species are subject to conservation, namely: the species has a small population, there is a sharp decline in the number of individuals in the wild, and the species has a limited distribution range (endemic). This regulation provides the basis that plant species with limited reproductive potential cannot be economically exploited and must be preserved to ensure their sustainability.

Tengkawang has different reproductive and distribution characteristics compared to the conservation criteria mentioned above. It is widely distributed in the tropical forests of Kalimantan and the surrounding areas, and it generally still has a large population in the wild. Although Tengkawang trees do not bear fruit every year, their reproductive cycle is relatively stable, producing a large quantity

of fruit during the harvest period, usually every three to five years (Fajri & Fernandes, 2019).

Therefore, Tengkawang does not fall into the category of plants whose utilization must be preserved, as it still has a sufficient population, a wide distribution area, and reproductive potential that allows for natural regeneration. This provides the foundation for the utilization of Tengkawang seeds, particularly for export, as long as there is oversight to ensure that harvesting does not damage the ecosystem or drastically reduce the population.

In accordance with the mandate of Law No. 5 of 1990, Article 4 on the Conservation of Biological Natural Resources and Their Ecosystems, it is stipulated that the conservation of biological natural resources and their ecosystems is the responsibility of both the government and the community. The responsibility for preserving natural resources cannot be left solely to the government. Instead, there must be synergy, with the community directly involved in every step of conservation. Public awareness and participation in environmental conservation are the key to maintaining the continuity of natural resources.

This is crucial to ensure that the exploitation of natural resources does not negatively impact the conservation of West Kalimantan's tropical rainforests. The government, through applicable regulations, must enforce strict standards in the utilization of non-timber forest products such as Tengkawang seeds and conduct effective oversight to ensure that the export process adheres to environmental sustainability principles.

Active participation from local communities and businesses in practicing responsible forest management is also key to maintaining a balance between economic needs and environmental conservation. As emphasized in Article 4 of Law No. 5 of 1990, this responsibility is a mandate that must be borne jointly by the government and the community. Furthermore, in the context of Tengkawang seed exports, the government's role is not only in oversight but also in empowering local communities who rely on forest resources for their livelihoods.

This aligns with Article 69, paragraph (1) of Law No. 32 of 2009 on Environmental Protection and Management, which mandates public participation in environmental protection and management. Through synergy between the government, society, and private sectors, the export of Tengkawang seeds can become a sector that contributes to supporting regional economies without neglecting environmental aspects, thus achieving a balance between the utilization of natural resources and conservation efforts.

In addition to domestic regulations, Indonesia's commitment to forest conservation is also reflected in its participation in FLEGT (Forest Law Enforcement, Governance, and Trade), known in Indonesia as Forest Law Enforcement and Trade Governance (Kunkunrat & Hariyadi, 2018). This cooperation between producer and consumer countries addresses the prevalence

of illegal logging and illicit export-import activities, which also affect the sustainability of non-timber forest products like Tengkwang seeds. As part of FLEGT, Indonesia became the first country to sign a Voluntary Partnership Agreement (VPA) with the European Union in 2013. Through this VPA, forest products exported, including non-timber products, must comply with strict legality standards (Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan, 2017). This means that Tengkwang seeds and other forest products exported to Europe must come from legally and sustainably managed sources, ensuring a balance between economic benefits and environmental conservation. Thus, the various regulations concerning Tengkwang seeds as an export commodity, as well as Indonesia's participation in FLEGT and the implementation of the VPA, not only demonstrate the country's commitment to forest protection but also serve as a strategic step to ensure that the utilization of forest products, including Tengkwang seeds, is conducted in a sustainable and responsible manner, providing benefits to forest-dependent communities.

Legal Implications of Tengkwang Seed Export Practices on Natural Resource Sustainability

Sustainable and enduring management of forest resources is a responsibility mandated to the Indonesian nation under Article 33(3) of the 1945 Constitution: "Earth, water, and the natural resources contained within are controlled by the state and utilized for the greatest prosperity of the people" (Rachman, 2016). This mandate is reflected in Law No. 41 of 1999 on Forestry, later amended by Government Regulation in Lieu of Law (Perpu) No. 1 of 2004, which was subsequently ratified as Law No. 19 of 2004. Article 2 of Law No. 41 of 1999 stipulates that "the administration of forestry is based on utility and sustainability, populism, justice, mutual cooperation, transparency, and integration." These principles illustrate the government's theoretical commitment to implementing good governance in forest management, ensuring, safeguarding, and protecting forest functions.

The legal implications of exporting tengkwang seeds highlight the obligation to adhere to sustainability principles established by Indonesian environmental and forestry regulations. Under Law No. 41 of 1999 on Forestry, forest product utilization, including tengkwang seeds, must consider forest carrying capacity and sustainability. Excessive tengkwang seed harvesting without maintaining balance with the forest and ecosystem's support capacity could lead to legal violations and potentially damage existing natural resources (Serikat Petani Kelapa Sawit, n.d.). Therefore, strict monitoring of export activities is necessary to ensure adherence to regulatory provisions.

In order to ensure that tengkwang seed export practices support the sustainability of natural resources, clear and firm regulations concerning natural

resource management, particularly tengkawang, are essential. These regulations should encompass export quota limitations and supervision of seed collection practices by relevant authorities. Although tengkawang seeds have high economic value, exporting them without proper regulation could negatively impact the sustainability of natural resources.

A prominent scholar in natural resource and environmental management, Prof. Dr. Ir. Hj. Nurlita Pertiwi, M.T., emphasizes in her book, "Implementation of Sustainable Development in Indonesia," that sustainable development principles should be applied in forest product management, including tengkawang seeds, to address the constraints associated with forest resource utilization (Prof. Dr. Ir. HJ. Nurlita Pertiwi, 2017). According to Prof. Nurlita, sustainable development requires balancing current needs without compromising the potential to meet future needs

Under the sustainable development principles laid out in Law No. 41 of 1999 on Forestry regarding forest product utilization, tengkawang seed harvesting should be conducted wisely and in a controlled manner (Cahyani, 2020). The law emphasizes the importance of sustainable forest management and regulates forest functions for conservation, protection, and production (Dinas Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Kabupaten Karimun, 2024). Article 3 of Law No. 41 of 1999 emphasizes that forest product utilization must be conducted sustainably to maintain environmental conservation.

Although tengkawang seeds are not classified as protected forest products, their utilization must still align with natural resource sustainability principles. Business entities involved in tengkawang seed exports bear social and environmental responsibilities regulated under Law No. 32 of 2009 on Environmental Protection and Management. Obligations for sound environmental management include efforts for restoration, rehabilitation, and reforestation on lands where forest products have been extracted (Rasyidi et al., 2023). Neglecting these responsibilities could result in penalties, including fines or business license revocation (Kohilay et al., 2022). These legal implications ensure that natural resource exploitation prioritizes not only economic profit but also resource sustainability and the welfare of surrounding communities.

Non-compliant tengkawang seed export practices can lead to legal disputes between the government, business entities, and local communities. Such disputes may arise due to conflicting interests between economic needs and environmental protection (Rimbo Gunawan et al., 1998). According to Article 95 of Law No. 32 of 2009, communities have the right to file lawsuits against activities that damage the environment or compromise natural resource sustainability. Consequently, any violations in tengkawang seed export practices can trigger legal accountability, whether in the form of civil lawsuits, criminal charges, or administrative sanctions. As a member of various international conventions on the environment and forestry,

such as the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) and the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES), Indonesia is obligated to preserve biodiversity (Samedi, 2015). Therefore, a legal implication of tengkawang seed exports is that Indonesia must ensure that such activities do not violate international commitments, especially those related to the preservation of forest plant species and tropical ecosystems.

Under the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (KLHK) Regulation No. P.106/MENLHK/SETJEN/KUM.1/12/2018, tengkawang seeds are not included in the list of protected or conserved plants. This regulation permits economic development of non-timber forest products, such as tengkawang seeds, while still considering ecological carrying capacity. Legally, this indicates that tengkawang seed utilization is allowed and is not subject to specific regulations concerning protected plant species.

However, this ministerial regulation conflicts with the Ministry of Trade Regulation No. 44 of 2012, which lists tengkawang as a plant prohibited from export. This ban aims to control the exploitation of natural resources that pose risks to environmental conservation. Following the issuance of this regulation, there has been a significant decline in tengkawang trade, affecting international market demand and ultimately impacting the income of local communities relying on tengkawang seeds as a source of income. While this policy was intended to protect tengkawang conservation, it has also created economic barriers for communities dependent on tengkawang resources.

Prior to the issuance of Ministerial Regulation No. 44/M-DAG/PER/7/2012 on Export-Prohibited Goods, Riko noted in his journal, "The Value of Tengkawang (*Shorea Spp*) Benefits for Communities in Embaloh Hilir District, Kapuas Hulu Regency, West Kalimantan," that the average income from tengkawang seed sales was around IDR 10,812,962 per household per harvest (priced at IDR 7,000 per kg), timber at IDR 566,769 per household per harvest (priced at IDR 1,340,000 per m³), and resin or sap at IDR 4,700 per household per harvest (priced at IDR 1,000 per kg) (Riko et al., 2013).

This regulatory overlap complicates licensing processes, delays exports, and results in economic losses for exporters. When conflicting policies coexist, the consequence is legal uncertainty or failure to meet legal objectives due to poor coordination among responsible ministries (Rusydi et al., 2022). which should ideally cooperate to create harmonious policies that support economic growth while safeguarding environmental sustainability.

Unsynchronized regulations may encourage illegal activities that harm natural resource sustainability, such as tengkawang seed smuggling and uncontrolled exploitation to avoid complex procedures. This not only damages the environment but also creates an unregulated black market. Meanwhile, local communities dependent on tengkawang seed utilization may suffer adverse

impacts if unsynchronized regulations lead to bans or restrictions on tengkawang seed collection and trade.

The presence of conflicting norms between two ministerial regulations, where the norms are contradictory and of equivalent hierarchy, allows for a judicial review by the Supreme Court (Arifin & Satria, 2020). Such review may be conducted upon application by parties affected by legal uncertainty arising from this regulatory disharmony (Basuki Kurniawan & Purbosari, 2022). Moreover, a ministerial regulation remains in force until it is either revoked or annulled by the issuing minister (Dewansyah, 2014). Given the inconsistency between the Ministry of Environment and Forestry Regulation (LHK) and the Ministry of Trade Regulation, the principle of legal preference, *Lex posterior derogat legi priori*, dictates that the newer law should override the older one in case of conflict (Irfani, 2020). In this context, Ministry of Trade Regulation No. 44 of 2012 should be considered void, given that it predates the Ministry of Environment and Forestry Regulation No. P.106/MENLHK/SETJEN/KUM 1/12/2018.

D. CONCLUSION

The regulation of tengkawang seed exports aims to maintain a balance between economic utilization and the conservation of natural resources, particularly in preserving biodiversity. Although tengkawang is not categorized as a protected species under the Ministry of Environment and Forestry Regulation, the export provisions aim to ensure that the exploitation of this non-timber forest product is conducted sustainably and in alignment with environmental and forestry laws. Harmonization of regulations between the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (PERMEN LHK) and the Ministry of Trade (PERMENDAG) is crucial to support forest carrying capacity and avoid negative impacts on the ecosystem and the economic well-being of tengkawang farmers.

The export of tengkawang seeds must comply with applicable legal provisions, especially those related to environmental protection and natural resource sustainability. Violations of these regulations may result in administrative or criminal sanctions, including fines, license revocation, or other legal actions. Additionally, the government has an obligation to harmonize domestic regulations with international commitments concerning forest ecosystem protection, ensuring that tengkawang seed exports neither harm conservation efforts nor breach the existing legal framework.

REFERENCES

- Alfiana, R. (2020). *Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Lingkungan Hidup Dan Kehutanan Nomor P.106/menlhk/setjen/kum.1/12/2018 (Satwa Dilindungi Di Yogyakarta)*.
- APINDO. (2024). *Roadmap Perekonomian Kontribusi Apindo Bagi Kepemimpinan Nasional*

2024 - 2029.

- Arifin, Z., & Satria, A. P. (2020). Disharmonisasi Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Di Indonesia: Antara Bentuk, Penyebab Dan Solus. *Jurnal Pro Hukum : Jurnal Penelitian Bidang Hukum Universitas Gresik*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.55129/jph.v9i1.1016>
- Astana, S., Antaatmaja, S., Effendi, R., & Buharman. (1987). Efisiensi Tata Niaga Ekspor Biji Tengkwang Dari Kalimantan Barat. *Jurnal Penelitian Hasil Hutan Forest Product Research Journal*, 4(2), 1-9. <https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/179790-ID-efisiensi-tataniaga-ekspor-biji-tengkawa.pdf>
- Azzahra, A. A. (2023). Strategi Tingkatkan Ekspor Indonesia dengan Modal Sosial antara UMKM dan Eksportir Muda. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional*, 1079-1090.
- Badan Standardisasi Nasional. (2021). *Solusi Hambatan Ekspor*. <https://bsn.go.id/main/berita/detail/12439/solusi-hambatan-ekspor>
- Bahruni, D. S. (2020). *Kecenderungan Ekspor Hasil Hutan Bukan Kayu Tengkwang Indonesia ke Negara Jepang Tahun 2005-2018* [IPB UNIVERSITY BOGOR OF INDONESIA]. <https://repository.ipb.ac.id/handle/123456789/102607>
- Basuki Kurniawan, & Purbosari, N. R. (2022). Penyelesaian Disharmoni Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Melalui Jalur Mediasi. *Al-IHKAM: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga Jurusan Ahwal Al-Syakhshiyah Fakultas Syariah IAIN Mataram*, 14(1), 83-96. <https://doi.org/10.20414/alihkam.v14i1.4734>
- Cahyani, F. A. (2020). Upaya Peningkatan Daya Dukung Lingkungan Melalui Penerapan Prinsip Sustainable Development Berdasarkan Undang-Undang Nomor 32 Tahun 2009 tentang Perlindungan dan Pengelolaan Lingkungan Hidup. *Indonesian State Law Review (ISLRev)*, 2(2), 168-179. <https://doi.org/10.15294/islrev.v2i2.38472>
- Darmawan, M. A., Ramadhani, N. H., Hubeis, N. A., Ramadhan, M. Y. A., Sahlan, M., Abd-Aziz, S., & Gozan, M. (2022). Natural sunscreen formulation with a high sun protection factor (SPF) from tengkwang butter and lignin. *Industrial Crops and Products*, 177(October 2021), 114466. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indcrop.2021.114466>
- Dewansyah, B. (2014). *Kedudukan Peraturan Menteri dalam Hierarki Peraturan Perundang-undangan*. <https://www.hukumonline.com/klinik/a/kedudukan-peraturan-menteri-dalam-hierarki-peraturan-perundang-undangan-lt5264d6b08c174/>
- Diba, F., Afra, A., & Tavita, G. E. (2023). Formulasi Dan Evaluasi Handbody Lotion Berbahan Dasar Lemak Tengkwang (Illipe Butter). *Jurnal Hutan Lestari*, 11(3), 700. <https://doi.org/10.26418/jhl.v11i3.71156>
- Dinas Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Kabupaten Karimun. (2024). *Sektor Kehutanan*. Dinas Penanaman Modal Dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Kabupaten Karimun. <https://dpmptsp.karimunkab.go.id/sektor->

kehutanan/

- Dr. Nurul Qamar, S.H., M. H., & Farah Syah Rezah, S.H., M. H. (2020). *Metode Penelitian Hukum Doktrinal dan Non-doktrinal* (A. K. Muzakkir & F. Rahman (eds.); 1st ed.). CV. Social Politic Genius (SIGn). <https://repository.umi.ac.id/2676/1/9786025522468.pdf>
- Fajri, M., & Fernandes, A. (2019). *Pola Pemanenan Buah Tengkawang (Shorea Machrophylla) Dan Regenerasi Alaminya Dikebun Masyarakat Harvesting Patterns Of Tengkawang (Shorea Machrophylla) And Its Natural Regeneration ... Tengkawang Termasuk Pohon Khas Kalimantan Dari Famili Dipterocarpa*. May.
- Farida Herry Susanty, & Deddy Dwi Nur Cahyono. (2020). Karakteristik Biometrik Jenis Shorea Spp Penghasil Tengkawang Dalam Ekosistem Hutan Alam. *Talenta Conference Series: Agricultural and Natural Resources (ANR)*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.32734/anr.v3i1.838>
- Heri, V., Bakara, D. O., Hermanto, Mulyana, A., Moeliana, M., & Yuliani, E. L. (2020). Tengkawang sebagai "Perekat" Pengelolaan Daerah Aliran Sungai Terpadu: Pengalaman di DAS Labian-Leboyan. *Tengkawang Sebagai "Perekat" Pengelolaan Daerah Aliran Sungai Terpadu: Pengalaman Di DAS Labian-Leboyan*, 292. <https://doi.org/10.17528/cifor/007703>
- Irfani, N. (2020). Lex superior, lex specialis. *Legislasi Indonesia*, 16(3), 305–325.
- Jumanto, & Martono, D. S. (2020). Dampak Program Perhutanan Sosial Skema Kemitraan Kehutanan Terhadap Kelestarian Hutan Dan Pendapatan Petani Hutan. *Gontor AGROTECH Science Journal*, 6(3), 579–602.
- Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan. (2017). *Indonesia Merupakan Negara Pertama Dan Satu-satunya Di Dunia Pemegang Lisensi Flegt*. <https://ppid.menlhk.go.id/berita/siaran-pers/3566/indonesia-merupakan-negara-pertama-dan-satu-satunya-di-dunia-pemegang-lisensi-flegt>
- Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan. (2023). *Peran Rimbawan Dalam Geopolitik Sumber Daya Hutan Menuju Indonesia Emas 2045*. Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup Dan Kehutanan. <https://ppid.menlhk.go.id/berita/siaran-pers/6057/peran-rimbawan-dalam-geopolitik-sumber-daya-hutan-menuju-indonesia-emas-2045>
- Kementerian Perdagangan Republik Indonesia. (2021). *Warta Edisi IV Volume 20 Tahun 2021*. https://bkperdag.kemendag.go.id/media_content/2021/12/publikasi_20220201172225wartaedisiivvolume20tahun2021.pdf
- Kohilay, P. Y., Eliazer, S., & Bakarbesy, A. D. (2022). Penegakan Hukum Administrasi Terhadap Izin Usaha Perkebunan Budidaya Di Kabupaten Seram Bagian Timur. *Tatohi Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 2(1), 113–121.
- Kunkunrat, & Hariyadi, R. P. (2018). Kerja Sama FLEGT-VPA (Forest Law Enforcement Government and Trade-Voluntary Partnership Agreement) Indonesia-Uni Eropa dalam Peningkatan Ekspor Produk Hasil Hutan

- Indonesia ke Uni Eropa. *TRANSBORDERS: International Relations Journal*, 1(1), 50–60. <https://doi.org/10.23969/transborders.v1i1.743>
- Kusumaningtyas, V. A., Sulaeman, A., & Yusnelti. (2012). Potensi Lemak Biji Tengkwang Terhadap Kandungan Mikroba Pangan Pada Pembuatan Mie Basah. *Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Hayati Dan Fisik*, 14(2), 140–147. <https://jurnal.unpad.ac.id/bionatura/article/viewFile/7626/3502>
- Leksono, B., & Hakim, L. (2018). Keragaman Kandungan Lemak Nabati Spesies Shorea Penghasil Tengkwang dari Beberapa Provenans dan Ras Lahan. *Jurnal Ilmu Kehutanan*, 12(2), 212. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jik.40155>
- Menteri LHK. (2020). *Status Hutan & Kehutanan Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup Dan Kehutanan Indonesia 2020*.
- Nurhikmah, S. (2023). *Standar Ekspor Yang Wajib Dipenuhi Seorang Ekspertir*. Golocad.
- Nuryanti, M., & Suwarno, A. (2021). Persepsi Masyarakat Dusun Melayang Terhadap Potensi Buah Tengkwang (*Shorea Spp*) Sebagai Salah Satu Buah Langka Bernilai Ekonomi Dari Kalimantan Barat. *Sosial Horizon: Jurnal Pendidikan Sosial*, 8(1), 127–137. <https://doi.org/10.31571/sosial.v8i1.3256>
- Prof. Dr. Ir. HJ. Nurlita Pertiwi, M. . (2017). *Implementasi Sustainable Development Di Indonesia* (M. E. Prof. Dr. Hamzah Upu (ed.); Cetakan Pe). PUSTAKA RAMADHAN. [https://eprints.unm.ac.id/15332/1/Sustainable Development Buku.pdf](https://eprints.unm.ac.id/15332/1/Sustainable%20Development%20Buku.pdf)
- Putri, D. F., & Yuliani, Y. (2023). Implikasi Etika Bisnis Dalam Perdagangan Internasional: Tinjauan Terhadap Kegiatan Ekspor Dan Impor. *Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen, Bisnis Dan Kewirausahaan*, 3(2), 119–130. <https://doi.org/10.55606/jurimbik.v3i2.457>
- Rachman, I. N. (2016). Politik Hukum Pengelolaan Sumber Daya Alam Menurut Pasal 33 UUD 1945. *Jurnal Konstitusi*, 13(1). <file:///C:/Users/user/Downloads/melisafd,+9-Irfan+Nur+Rachman.pdf>
- Rahman, A., & Mulada, D. A. (2020). *Kajian Yuridis Dan Sosiologis Pemungutan Hasil Hutan Negara*. 35(3), 338–352.
- Ramadhan, R. M., & Mandasari, V. (2024). Implementasi 7n1 Arrows Export Of Management Untuk Meningkatkan Peluang Rencana Bisnis Ekspor Fesyen Jurnal Pemasaran Bisnis. *Jurnal Pemasaran Bisnis*, 6(3), 599–615.
- Randa, R. A., manurung, T. F., & Artuti, H. (2022). Identifikasi Morfologi Jenis Pohon Tengkwang (*Shorea Spp.*) di Desa Mamek. *Jurnal Lingkungan Hutan Tropis*, 1(1), 53–58.
- Rasyidi, B., Nachrawi, G., & Juwita. (2023). The Principle of Strict Liability in Prosecuting Environmental Criminal Actions by Corporations. *Journal Humaniora: Jurnal Hukum Dan Ilmu Sosial*, 01(02), 41–47.
- Riko, Lumangkun, A., & Wardenaar, E. (2013). Nilai Manfaat Tengkwang (*Shorea Spp*) Bagi Masyarakat Di Kecamatan Embaloh Hilir Kabupaten Kapuas Hulu Kalimantan

Barat. 83–91.

- Rimbo Gunawan, Juni Thamrin, & Endang Suhendar. (1998). *Industrialisasi Kehutanan dan Dampaknya terhadap Masyarakat Adat: Kasus Kalimantan (AKATIGA (ed.))*. Bandung: Yayasan AKATIGA. <https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/478-ID-industrialisasi-kehutanan-dan-dampaknya-terhadap-masyarakat-adat-kasus-kalimanta.pdf>
- Riska, ., & Manurung, T. F. (2019). Morfologi Vegetatif Jenis Pohon Tengkawang (*Shorea Spp*) Di Desa Mensiau Kecamatan Batang Lupar Kabupaten Kapuas Hulu. *Jurnal TENGWANG*, 8(2), 110–121. <https://doi.org/10.26418/jt.v8i2.31077>
- Rusydi, M., Utami, N. S., & Muchsin, N. (2022). Kewenangan Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham Dalam Menyelesaikan Tumpang Tindih Peraturan Menteri Untuk Mencapai Kepastian Hukum Di Indonesia. *Dinamika*, 28(13), 5138–5154.
- Samedi. (2015). Konservasi Keanekaragaman Hayati di Indonesia: Rekomendasi Perbaikan Undang-Undang Konservasi. *Jurnal Hukum Lingkungan*, 2(2). <file:///C:/Users/user/Downloads/filayudha,+Journal+manager,+Samedi.pdf>
- Saridan, A., Fernandes, A., & Noor, M. (2013). SEBARAN DAN POTENSI POHON TENGWANG DI HUTAN PENELITIAN LABANAN, KALIMANTAN TIMUR. 7(2), 101–108.
- Serikat Petani Kelapa Sawit. (n.d.). *Laporan Implementasi Draft Pendekatan SKT-NKT yang Disederhanakan untuk Petani Swadaya di Mondi Sekadau Hulu Sekadau*. https://spks.or.id/file/publikasi/230330_1_Final_Report_of_Implementation_HCS-HCV_Approach_at_Mondi_Village_EN_ver02_230329.pdf
- Siti. (2023). Larangan Ekspor Bikin Tengkawang Tidak Lagi Dilirik. *Pontianak Post*. <https://pontianakpost.jawapos.com/pro-bisnis/1462744129/larangan-ekspor-bikin-tengkawang-tidak-lagi-dilirik>
- Tampubolon, S., Manurung, F., & Latifah, S. (2018). *Sebaran Tengkawang (Shorea spp) Berdasarkan Fitogeografi Pada Hutann Adat Pengajit Desa Saham Kecamatan Seluas Kabupaten Bengkayang*. 6(4), 883–893.
- Wahyuni, W. (2022). *Sejumlah Dampak Larangan Ekspor*. <https://www.hukumonline.com/berita/a/sejumlah-dampak-larangan-ekspor-lt62664752d57af/?page=all>
- Wicaksana, P. (2022). *Pakar Hukum Lingkungan UNAIR: Regulasi Pengelolaan Lingkungan di Indonesia Harus Dievaluasi*. <https://fh.unair.ac.id/pakar-hukum-lingkungan-unair-regulasi-pengelolaan-lingkungan-di-indonesia-harus-dievaluasi/>
- Winarni, B., Alex, T., Lahjie, A., Ruslim, dan Y., Pertanian Negeri Samarinda, P., Sam Ratulangi, jl, Panjang, G., Kehutanan, F., Mulawarman, U., Ki Hajar

- Dewantara, J., & Kelua, G. (2017). Production and Financial Analysis of Tengkawang Cultivation by People in West Kalimantan. *Jurnal Hutan Tropis*, 5(3), 236–243.
- Winarni, I., Sumadiwangsa, E. ., & Setyawan, D. (2004). The effect of growth site, species, and stem diameter of Tengkawang trees on seed productivity. *Jurnal Penelitian Hasil Hutan*, 22(1), 23–33.
- Yuniansari, R. (2023). Perlindungan Hutan Dan Fungsinya Bagi Kehidupan Manusia Dan Lingkungan Alam. *Jurnal Kompilasi Hukum*, 8(2). <https://doi.org/10.29303/jkh.v8i2.144>

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author is a student of the Faculty of Law at Universitas Muhammadiyah Surabaya. The author expresses gratitude to the faculty lecturers of Universitas Muhammadiyah Surabaya and everyone involved in assisting with the completion of this article.

COMPETING INTEREST

We declare that there are no competing interests among the authors regarding this research article.